Exhibit 1

STAFF REPORT



PLANNING & ZONING COMMISSION

Village Green Municipal Building, Council Chambers 47 Hall Street Wednesday, September 15, 2021 7:00 P.M.

2. SKETCH PLAN REVIEW

Applicant: Crawford Hoying & The Fischer Group

Location: 100 South Liberty St

Existing Zoning: PC – Planned Commercial District

Request: Review of a Sketch Plan for a new automotive development on a ±1.5 acre site.

Aerial Site Image: https://www.google.com/maps/@40.1557261,-83.0739996,190m/data=!3m1!1e3



Project Background

This is a new submission for the potential revision of an approved development at 110 South Liberty Street to complete the previously approved development with single-family townhome condominiums. The Commission recommended approval, and City Council approved, an ordinance for a final development plan to approve 22 units and a commercial building on the site. The original proposal included a commercial building along the Liberty Street frontage as well as the retention of the existing historic home on the site. All required infrastructure is developed on the site, in terms of access off Liberty Street, internal drives, parking areas and stormwater management. No changes are proposed to the infrastructure with this proposal.

Process

In accordance with the requirements of Codified Ordinance 1143.11(a), the Commission shall review a Sketch Plan, as the first step, with the owner/developer and provide comments during the meeting, it being understood that no statement by officials of the City shall be binding upon either. While the development is approved, the proposed changes are significant to require the applicant to re-start the entitlement process based on the Code. This submission is informal and for the purpose of establishing communication and discussing the concept for

completing the development of the site. No formal action will be taken on the Sketch Plan. Future reviews by the Commission will be for a Preliminary and Final Development Plan, which may be combined. City Council will be the final approving body.

Proposal Overview

The applicant is proposing to revise the previously approved development plan to complete the development of the site with the same use as previously approved (single-family townhomes for sale), however, the applicant is no longer proposing a commercial building along the Liberty Street frontage and the existing house along Liberty Street is proposed to be demolished. Approved in 2015, the Powell Green development plan included 22 duplex condominiums in 11 buildings as well as a retail/commercial building along the South Liberty Street frontage. All buildings included rear-loaded garages, accesses by private drives and the parking for the commercial building was proposed to the north and east (rear) of the building. The required infrastructure, including underground stormwater management was constructed during the first phase as well as four of the condo building, located to the rear (east) of the site for a total of eight units. The applicant has stated that the constructed housing product was not accepted in the local market and proved difficult to sell.

The revised proposal is for the same land use, single-family condominiums, utilizing the same (existing) infrastructure. Instead of the remaining 14 units in seven buildings and the commercial building, proposed are 23 units in four buildings. Three of the proposed buildings are designed with five units and the southernmost building is proposed to contain eight units. This proposal places residential units along the Liberty Street frontage in place of the previously approved commercial building and the applicant is also requesting approval of the demolition of the existing building on the site. As previously approved, all units will included first floor garages, accessed from the rear. The central open space and all internal paths will remain.

Comprehensive Plan Consistency

This site is designated as Mixed Use Village Center and Village Residential in the Land Use chapter of the Comprehensive Plan. Stated in the plan, "Within this area a variety of uses and activities are encouraged to support a vibrant, walkable village center." As previously approved, Staff and the Commission agree that the proposed residential use is appropriate for this site as well as permitted in the Code. However, the lack of commercial space within this proposal does not meet the Plan. The applicant has attempted to address this concern by creating the opportunity for live work spaces, particularly for the units along Liberty Street.

The Plan also discusses high quality materials and architectural detailing as critical to ensure new development contributes to the village character. Staff and the Architectural Advisor are concerned, that while the materials are generally accepted in the Architectural Guidelines, the rear and side elevations lack definition, interest and relief. Of particular concern are the side elevations visible from Liberty Street.

Exhibit 2.3: Mixed Use Village Center Detail

Murphy Pkwy

Mixed Use and Commercial Buildings

Parks & Recreation

Village Residential

Civic/Institutional

Staff Comments

While the proposal meets the Zoning Code for permitted uses, Staff is concerned about the lack of commercial use along the South Liberty Road frontage as the Comprehensive Plan indicates on the Future Land Use Map. The elimination of the existing home will require specific approval from the Commission. The building was previously proposed to remain and be restored. The applicant has provided information indicating that the rehabilitation of the building is not feasible.

The applicant has worked with the property owner to the south to clean, grade and landscape the common property line at the request of the property owner and Staff. The property owner has indicated appreciation and satisfaction to Staff that the issue was addressed.

The Code limits the height of building to 35 feet and the plans provided for this review do not indicate the building height. The previous proposal was limited to two-story buildings as well as two units per building. As proposed, the roof pitches, story height and massing are in contrast with what was previously approved. There are few three-story buildings in the downtown vernacular of Powell and the proposed architecture seemingly highlights the height of the buildings. While the front elevations provide elements of recesses and projections, those elements are lacking along the side and rear elevations. While not explicitly shown, Staff assumes each of the proposed buildings will have the same elevation. No information is proved, at this point, regarding color changes. All materials appear to be consistent along all elevations. During the review of the original proposal, there was concern regarding the limited elevation variation. The applicant has met several times with the Architectural Advisor and made revisions to the proposal, however, the proposed footprint of the units do not lend themselves to create the architectural interest and variation desired.

Staff Recommendation

According to the Zoning Code, "the Commission shall review the Sketch Plan with the owner and provide the owner with comments during the meeting, it being understood that no statement by officials of the City shall be binding upon either. This submission is informal and for the purpose of establishing communication and discussing the concept for developing the tract. No formal action will be taken on the Sketch Plan".

Staff recommends the Commission provide the applicant/owner with comments regarding the following questions and any other topics the Commission wishes to discuss:

- 1) Does the proposal adhere sufficiently to the Comprehensive Plan, particularly in terms of land use?
- 2) Does the Commission support the proposed building type and architectural character?
- 3) Does the Commission desire input from the Historic Downtown Architectural Commission as part of a future review step?
- 4) What concerns, if any, does the Commission have regarding the proposed demolition of the existing house?
- 5) Other comments by the Commission.