



STAFF REPORT

PLANNING & ZONING COMMISSION

Village Green Municipal Building, Council Chambers
47 Hall Street
Wednesday, June 24, 2020
7:00 P.M.

1. FINAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN REVIEW

Applicant: The Camber Company, LLC
Location: 2630 Carriage Road and 8061 Liberty Road
Existing Zoning: (FR-1) Farm Residence District – Liberty Township
Proposed Zoning: (PR) Planned Residence District – City of Powell
Request: To review a plan to annex land into the City of Powell for a single-family subdivision of twenty-three (23) lots on approximately 7.72 acres.

Aerial Site Image: <https://goo.gl/maps/hwuqcKNmyMvodXV2A>

Project Background

The applicant has previously brought forward a Sketch Plan/Annexation for this property on October 23, 2019 and a Preliminary Development Plan review on February 12, 2020 (staff reports below). At the Sketch Plan review, there were concerns about density, green space, setbacks from Carriage Road, off-site drainage concerns, and traffic concerns related to the future County proposed roundabout at Carriage and Liberty Roads. Also of concern, was the quality and manner of the home designs and cost ranges. At the Preliminary Development Plan review, residents and the commission provided the applicant with a number of suggestions. The applicant has included those suggestions and worked with the City and County Engineering departments to design the site layout.

As part of the preliminary development plan approval conditions, the applicant was required to submit the annexation petition prior to submittal of the Final Development Plan. The applicant has submitted the petition.

The land is currently a horse stable with riding lessons and two homes. The current property owner wishes to sell and quit the horse business at this location. The analysis of traffic for the proposed “empty nester” single-family development is included in the packet.

Proposal Overview

The current proposal remains the same, consisting of 23 homes on 7.7 acres, creating a gross density of 2.9 dwelling units per acre. The plan provides more green space, buffering to the east, and a larger retention area to the west. There are sidewalks throughout, however there is no trail along Carriage Road to get people from this development west to the Powell trail system. There is also perimeter fencing proposed.

Changes since the Last Submission

The applicant made the following changes since the last submission:

- 1) All Final Development Plan application requirements are provided.
- 2) Refined architecture exhibits along with illustrative elevations.
- 3) Provided a preliminary drainage analysis.

Ordinance Review

In accordance with the requirements of codified ordinance 1143.11(k), in approving a final development plan, the Planning and Zoning Commission shall adhere to the steps below:

Recommendation by the Planning and Zoning Commission. Within thirty (30) days after the Public Hearing on the final development plan the Planning and Zoning Commission shall recommend that the final development plan be approved as presented, approved with supplementary conditions, or

disapproved, and shall transmit all papers constituting the record and the recommendations to Council.

Before making its recommendation, the Planning and Zoning Commission shall find that the facts submitted with the application and presented at the public hearing establish that:

(1) The proposed planned district development phase can be initiated within two (2) years of the date of approval and can be completed within five (5) years;

The applicant has mentioned to Staff that they would like to begin construction immediately. Staff believes that this project could be absorbed within five years.

(2) The requirements of the Comprehensive Plan relative to the site at issue have been fulfilled;

This proposal is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan. The continuation of residential development and having a concentrated corner of “empty nester” housing is consistent with housing policies within the plan. Also, this development will not attract many families with children or increase much traffic in the area when compared to the existing use. The development can also be designed to allow for the needed rights-of-way for a much needed roundabout at Carriage and Liberty Roads, according to the County Engineer.

The comprehensive plan calls for a strategic annexation policy and redevelopment along existing corridors. According to the plan, “New suburban single family subdivisions are most appropriate for smaller infill development sites surrounded by existing single family developments.” Already developed single-family lots currently surround the site, so the proposed redevelopment along Liberty Road remains consistent with the comprehensive plan. The smaller lot sizes as proposed will help to diversify the city’s housing stock, while providing high quality homes that are consistent with Comprehensive Plan and the applicant’s other developments within Powell (Carriage Cove and Morris Station). In addition, this annexation could potentially lead to the annexation of other nearby single-family lots on Carriage Road and Liberty Road since there are larger lots near this site.

(3) The streets proposed are suitable and adequate to carry the anticipated traffic, and increased densities will not generate traffic in such amounts as to overload the street network outside the planned district plan area;

The street network is already overwhelmed at peak times by the school near the site. This project is unlikely to generate anything in excess of an already heavily-used roadway. A traffic analysis provided by the applicant confirms this.

The site provides a stub to the north for future possible connection. The roads in the site will be public.

The applicant has worked with County and City Engineers to accommodate a future roundabout a shown on recent plans being developed by the County Engineer.

(4) Proposed non-residential developments can be justified at the location and in the amounts proposed;

There is no non-residential developments in this proposal.

(5) Housing densities are warranted by amenities and conditions incorporated in the final development plan and are in accordance with these planned district development requirements;

This development is unique from its surroundings. The neighboring uses are 1-acre lots with large single-family homes. This proposal is higher in density compared to its surrounding uses. However, Staff sees the merit of this development and that it is entirely residential and geared towards empty nesters – means that it should have little negative impact on the existing residents.

(6) Lands to be dedicated to public use are of acceptable and usable size, shape, and location;

No lands to be dedicated for public use. However, Staff would like to see a public pathway along the front of the site.

(7) The area surrounding the development can be planned and zoned in coordination with and in substantial compatibility with the proposed development;

This proposal does not preclude the ability to plan or zone areas around the site.

(8) The existing and proposed utility services are adequate for the population densities and uses proposed, and

Letters provided by the applicant show that utilities are able to serve the site.

(9) Adequate provision has been made for the detention and channelization of surface drainage runoff.

The Powell Engineering Department has conducted a preliminary review and is satisfied with the drainage plan at this point.

Staff Comments

Staff will rely on the Architecture Advisor related to the home designs (see Architectural Advisor document). There needs to be “four wall architecture” for these homes, especially for the lots that back up to Liberty Road. The houses on these lots need to look as if the house is facing Liberty Road. There are homes plans in the packet that can be made to look like fronts due to the inclusion of porch elements.

Staff stresses that there is a need for a pathway to run along the frontage of Carriage Road and along the frontage of Liberty Road.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of the Final Development Plan subject to the following conditions:

1. The applicant work with the building and engineering department and satisfies their requirements.
2. That the developer take into account Staff recommendations on the architecture of the buildings as well as the Architectural Advisor recommendations.

Preliminary Development Plan – February 12, 2020

Project Background

The applicant has previously brought forward a Sketch Plan/Annexation for this property on October 23, 2019 (staff report below). At the Sketch Plan review, there were concerns about density, green space, setbacks from Carriage Road, off-site drainage concerns, and traffic concerns related to the future County proposed roundabout at Carriage and Liberty Roads. Also of concern, was the quality and manner of the home designs and cost ranges.

The land is currently a horse stable with riding lessons and two homes. The current property owner wishes to sell and quit the horse business at this location. The analysis of traffic for the proposed “empty nester” single-family development is included in the packet.

Proposal Overview

The current proposal consists of 23 homes on 7.7 acres, creating a gross density of 2.9 dwelling units per acre. The plan was altered to create more green space, buffering to the east, a larger retention area to the west. There are sidewalks throughout, however there is no trail along Carriage Road to get people from this development west to the Powell trail system. There is also perimeter fencing proposed.

Changes Since the Last Submission

The overall density was reduced, additional green space provided, more detail about potential mounding and landscaping is provided and housing designs and floor plans have been submitted.

Ordinance Review

In accordance with the requirements of codified ordinance 1143.11(g), in approving a preliminary development plan, the Planning and Zoning Commission shall consider:

(1) If the proposed development is consistent with the intent and requirements of this Zoning Ordinance;

A Planned Residence District can be established with just about any sized lot as long as the design goal is to cluster homes to leave open space or to vary smaller and larger lots. This proposal sort of mixes the two. It is not a desirable location to have any publically utilized open spaces or parks, so the applicant will be paying a recreation fee instead. By having a density of under 3 units per acre, it is one of the least dense of this type neighborhood that has been created in Powell. Setbacks are being established with the specific home types that they have in mind and submitted with this text. Keeping a rural feeling with rail fencing and greenspaces along Carriage and Liberty Roads is preferred.

(2) The appropriateness of the proposed land uses with regard to their type, location, amount, and intensity, where not specifically specified in this Zoning Ordinance;

Single-family homes are appropriate for this area. The context of this development being an “empty nester cluster” could work well on this corner. Additional large lot home sites would not be feasible economically due to current residential land prices in the area. There are many ways to incorporate pockets of different styles and types of developments that will help “set apart” different areas of the community. In this way, adding to the sense of place of the area. It is of importance thought, to try to incorporate the design of the homes and landscaping to work with the existing context – large lot, rural living homes.

(3) The relationships between uses, and between uses and public facilities, streets, and pathways;
The proposal access Carriage Road and will provide traffic onto Liberty Road and Carriage Road. The County Engineer has indicated that they are studying the Liberty Road/Carriage Road intersection for a roundabout. Therefore, the correct amount of right-of-way needed to implement a roundabout will need to be reserved with this development. There are no proposed pathways external to this site. There needs to be a pathway along the entire frontage of Carriage Road and Liberty Road.

(4) Adequacy of provisions for traffic and circulation, and the geometry and characteristics of street and pathway systems;

Staff is recommending the streets be private and maintained by the HOA. If there is a subdivision that happens to extend the street to the north, then at that time we may need to investigate a public street, however provisions should be made in the documentation at the Final Development Plan that the extension of the private street be required by the HOA in the future.

(5) Adequacy of yard spaces and uses at the periphery of the development;

For a proposed empty nester development, the setbacks are reasonable. Also, the location of the green spaces will make the yard actually look larger.

(6) Adequacy of open spaces and natural preserves and their relationships to land use areas and public access ways;

All of the proposed open spaces will remain privately held with the association maintenance. This is adequate as there are schoolyards nearby.

(7) The order, or phases, in which the development will occur and the land uses and quantities to be developed at each phase;

This development will be built in one phase, which is appropriate.

(8) Estimates of the time required to complete the development and its various phases;

The infrastructure should be completed within 2020, with house construction going through 2022.

(9) Improvements to be made by the Municipality, if any, and their cost;

No municipal improvements are necessary due to this development. The County proposed roundabout is an improvement needed due to the growth all around the area as the growth of the schools.

(10) The community cost of providing public services to the development, and

Our analysis from the sketch plan is that it is positive.

(11) Impacts of the development on surrounding or adjacent areas.

The traffic analysis shows that the impact will be minor and in addition to that, the previous land use did account for some traffic in the area, so the impact of this new development is further diminished. The impact on the schools is less due to the design of the units and empty nester configuration.

Staff is concerned about the impacts of storm water drainage upon downstream properties. Our City Engineer's office will be looking at this closely with the design of the outlet of storm water and how it will affect downstream erosion.

The Planning and Zoning Commission may require the staging of the planned development to minimize early stage major impacts on the community infrastructure and services systems, and may require the staging of land uses to be generally consistent with the phased development of supporting land uses and public services and facilities.

The Commission's approval in principle of the preliminary development plan shall be necessary before an applicant may submit a final development plan. Approval in principle shall not be construed to endorse a precise location of uses, configuration of parcels, or engineering feasibility.

Comprehensive Plan Consistency

This proposal is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan. The continuation of residential development and having a concentrated corner of “empty nester” housing is consistent with housing policies within the plan. Also, this development will not attract many families with children or increase much traffic in the area when compared to the existing use. The development can also be designed to allow for the needed rights-of-way for a much needed roundabout at Carriage and Liberty Roads, according to the County Engineer.

The comprehensive plan calls for a strategic annexation policy and redevelopment along existing corridors. According to the plan, “New suburban single family subdivisions are most appropriate for smaller infill development sites surrounded by existing single family developments.” Already developed single-family lots currently surround the site, so the proposed redevelopment along Liberty Road remains consistent with the comprehensive plan. The smaller lot sizes as proposed will help to diversify the city’s housing stock, while providing high quality homes that are consistent with Comprehensive Plan and the applicant’s other developments within Powell (Carriage Cove and Morris Station). In addition, this annexation could potentially lead to the annexation of other nearby single-family lots on Carriage Road and Liberty Road since there are larger lots near this site.

Staff Comments

The annexation petition has not yet been submitted to the County Commissioners. This will be needed prior to the next step of a Final Development Plan.

Staff will rely on the Architecture Advisor related to the home designs (see Architectural Advisor document). There needs to be “four wall architecture” for these homes, especially for the lots that back up to Liberty Road. The houses on these lots need to look as if the house is facing Liberty Road. There are homes plans in the packet that can be made to look like fronts due to the inclusion of porch elements.

There is a need for a pathway to run along the frontage of Carriage Road and along the frontage of Liberty Road. It will also need to be properly designed to accommodate a future roundabout a shown on recent plans being developed by the County Engineer.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of the Preliminary Development Plan subject to the following conditions:

1. That the annexation petition is filed prior to submittal of the Final Development Plan.
2. That the roads be designed as private roads; however, if the north-south road is extended as a public road, then that portion become a public road. If that road is extended as a private road, then provisions shall be made in the HOA documents that the road is allowed to be extended for residential uses and they are allowed to traverse the private road on this development to get to Carriage Road.
3. That the City Engineer provide a full review of preliminary storm water calculation as part of the Final Development Plan.
4. That the developer take into account Staff recommendations on the architecture of the buildings as well as the Architectural Advisor recommendations.

Sketch Plan Review – October 23, 2019

Project Background

This is a new submittal for the properties at 2630 Carriage Road and 8061 Liberty Road, both of which are currently in Liberty Township and zoned as Farm Residence District. The property on Liberty Road is a single-family residence, and the Bayhill Horse Farm occupies the property on Carriage Road. The applicant is proposing to annex them into the City of Powell and develop these properties together as a residential subdivision.

Proposal Overview

The applicant is proposing to redevelop the site with 25 single-family, fee simple lots. Access to the subdivision will be off Carriage Road and all streets will be private. The overall site acreage is ±6.72 acres, with the minimum lot size being 52' by 120', giving the site a net density of ±3.70 dwellings per acre. The developer's intent is to aim this project towards empty-nester retirees.

Ordinance Review

In accordance with the requirements of codified ordinance 1143.11(a), the Commission shall review the Sketch Plan with the Owner and provide the Owner with comments during the meeting, it being understood that no statement by officials of the City shall be binding upon either. This submission is informal and for the purpose of establishing communication and discussing the concept for developing the tract. No formal action will be taken on the Sketch Plan.

Comprehensive Plan Consistency

The comprehensive plan calls for a strategic annexation policy and redevelopment along existing corridors. According to the plan, "New suburban single family subdivisions are most appropriate for smaller infill development sites surrounded by existing single family developments." Already developed single-family lots currently surround the site, so the proposed redevelopment along Liberty Road remains consistent with the comprehensive plan. The smaller lot sizes as proposed will help to diversify the city's housing stock, while providing high quality homes that are consistent with Comprehensive Plan and the applicant's other developments within Powell (Carriage Cove and Morris Station). In addition, this annexation could potentially lead to the annexation of other nearby single-family lots on Carriage Road and Liberty Road since there are larger lots near this site.

Staff Comments

Staff believes that this proposed redevelopment will fit in well with the existing site context. The proposed street layout, with the stub to the north, lends itself to further development to the north, which will be beneficial if annexation continues to northern parcels. The large setbacks and landscaping buffers along Carriage and Liberty Roads will help to enhance the area's rural charm. However, staff would like to see how lot numbers 1, 2, 3, 4, and 5 would be screened from the single-family residence to the east. It is also important that the lots near the intersection of Carriage and Liberty Roads (lots 14, 15, 16, and 17) be designed with "four-sided" architecture, as they will be highly visible by passing traffic. Moving forward to the preliminary development plan review, staff will need to see more site details including proposed sidewalks around the site and elevations for the homes.

Staff would recommend that the developer add bike paths to the south and west sides of the property due to the site's proximity to Wyandot Run Elementary and Olentangy Liberty Middle School. Bike paths will help residents get to and from school safely from the site. Staff also asks that the applicant ensure they have provided adequate space for the planned future roundabout at the intersection of Liberty Road and Carriage Road.

Additionally, staff has some reservations about the financial impact this development could have on the city. Since the city's northward growth corridor has been blocked by Liberty Township, the city has been forced to rethink Powell's annexation strategy. Annexing this site and developing it as proposed, namely for retirees, may not be a fiscally responsible decision for the city. According to the "Powell Fiscal Impact Template", an economic model used to estimate a development's costs to the city, if the site is developed entirely as senior housing the cost could range from \$15,000-18,000/year for the city. However, although this development is planned on being geared towards empty-nester retirees, in actuality, it is very likely that families with children will buy homes within the subdivision since it is located near an elementary and middle school. As you can see below, if only half of the homes are occupied by senior housing then the city's fiscal impacts analysis shows a positive of approximately \$3400/year.

CITY OF POWELL - SUMMARY OF FISCAL IMPACTS	
Please do not modify this worksheet	
Incremental revenues	
Income tax	\$17,424
Property tax*	\$15,777
Franchise fees	\$690
Road-related revenues	\$3,501
Total incremental revenues	\$37,391
Incremental expenses	
Admin., buildings, & IT	\$13,090
Police (net)	\$16,249
Parks & rec. (net)	\$1,952
Development, bldg., engineering (net)	\$2,730
Road maintenance	\$0
Total incremental expenditures	\$34,020
Net incremental revenue/expense	\$3,371

*The estimated value of the homes is \$500,000.

Overall, this proposal has benefits to the city of offering a new housing type, adding to the tax base, future possible annexation, and providing Powell with more control over lands near its border. As such, staff would like to see more details in a future submission.

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends the applicant proceed to the step of the review process with a preliminary development plan, taking into account comments by P&Z, residents, staff, and the Architectural Advisor.